Pb-free ferroelectrics investigated with density functional theory: SnAl\textsubscript{1/2}Nb\textsubscript{1/2}O\textsubscript{3} perovskites

Joseph W. Bennett, Ilya Grinberg, Peter K. Davies, and Andrew M. Rappe
1The Makineni Theoretical Laboratories, Department of Chemistry, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104-6323, USA
2Department of Materials Science and Engineering, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104-6272, USA

(Received 21 September 2010; revised manuscript received 11 February 2011; published 26 April 2011)

Interest in Pb-free ferroelectrics has intensified as the search for less toxic Pb replacements continues. Since Sn is isoelectronic with Pb, it has generated great interest. Most of this effort has focused on SnTiO\textsubscript{3}. Even though it shows impressive ferroelectricity in calculations, synthesis has proved elusive. We therefore use density-functional theory (DFT) to investigate B-site alternatives that involve smaller size to promote perovskite phase stability. In this paper, Sn(Al\textsubscript{1/2}Nb\textsubscript{1/2})O\textsubscript{3} (SAN) is investigated. We demonstrate that SAN is likely to be synthesizable, will be ferroelectric, and perhaps a good piezoelectric material as well. We discuss how cation displacements and their interactions affect the polarization of the solid solution. We also explore the electronic properties of the SAN solid solution and correlate them to the structural findings.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.83.144112 PACS number(s): 77.80.-c, 71.15.Mb, 81.05.Zz

I. INTRODUCTION

The discovery of extremely high piezoelectric coefficients in Pb(Mg\textsubscript{1/3}Nb\textsubscript{2/3})O\textsubscript{3}-PbTiO\textsubscript{3} (PMN-PT) relaxor ferroelectrics, and high transition temperatures in BiScO\textsubscript{3}-PbTiO\textsubscript{3} solid solutions has inspired an intense effort to understand the properties of these materials as well as to explore the properties of new solid solutions.\textsuperscript{1-4} One research strategy has been to investigate the replacement of the Pb atom on the perovskite A-site, motivated by the desire to replace Pb atoms with more benign species such as Bi, Ag, and Sn (Refs. 5–7).

The substitution of Pb by Sn has only recently begun to be investigated. The Sn\textsuperscript{2+} cation contains a 5\textsuperscript{2-} stereochemically active lone electron pair, which should function in a similar fashion to the 6\textsuperscript{2-} of Pb and thus Sn could be a suitable replacement for Pb. A recently published theoretical examination of SnTiO\textsubscript{3}, the Sn analog of ferroelectric PbTiO\textsubscript{3} (PT), showed significant Sn off-centering along c, increasing both the c/a ratio and \(\bar{P}\) relative to PT (Ref. 8). The ferroelectric instability of SnTiO\textsubscript{3} was also reported,\textsuperscript{9} where a detailed examination of the phonon spectra showed that a tetragonal phase is preferred to a cubic phase. Another theoretical paper by Matar et al. showed similar results for SnTiO\textsubscript{3}, though they divulged that attempts at conventional synthesis were not successful.\textsuperscript{7} If instead a microwave-hydrothermal synthesis is employed, solid solutions of (Ba\textsubscript{1-x}Sn\textsubscript{x})TiO\textsubscript{3} can be cleanly obtained up to \(x = 0.2\) (Refs. 10 and 11). A-site substitution of Sn into the (Ba\textsubscript{1-x}Ca\textsubscript{x})TiO\textsubscript{3} solid solution has been shown to enhance the Curie transition temperature even for <10\% substitution of Sn (Ref. 12).

Perovskite stability is related to the ratio of the ionic size of the A and B-sites, as expressed by the tolerance factor \(t\)

\[
t = \frac{R_{A-O}}{R_{B-O} \sqrt{2}},
\]

where \(R_{A-O}\) is the sum of A and O ionic radii and \(R_{B-O}\) is the sum of B and O ionic radii.\textsuperscript{13} The formation of the perovskite phase is favored when \(t\) is near unity. Using periodic trends of the Shannon-Prewitt radii, we estimate that in a 12-fold coordinated environment, the ionic radius of Sn\textsuperscript{2+}, \(r_{Sn^{2+}}\), should be about 10\% less than that of Pb\textsuperscript{2+} (1.49 Å), or 1.35 Å (Ref. 14). Even for \(t\) close to 1, perovskite stability can be hindered by the partial reduction of Sn to Sn\textsuperscript{0} or disproportionation to Sn\textsuperscript{0} and Sn\textsuperscript{4+} at elevated temperatures. Therefore, the search for suitable B-sites should focus on small cations that tend to prevent reduction of Sn at high temperatures.

An inspection of the Shannon radii shows that Al (\(r_{Al} = 0.53\) Å) has the smallest ionic radius for six-fold coordination of the cations commonly found on the B-site in perovskites.\textsuperscript{14} To ensure charge balance and the average +4 charge on the B-site, Nb (\(r_{NB} = 0.64\) Å) can be paired with Al. Nb has been shown to off-center in single crystal LiNbO\textsubscript{3} (Ref. 15) and the solid solution Pb(Mg\textsubscript{1/3}Nb\textsubscript{2/3})O\textsubscript{3} (PMN) (Refs. 16 and 17). The resultant Sn(Al\textsubscript{1/2}Nb\textsubscript{1/2})O\textsubscript{3} (SAN) solid solution should be close to the previously mentioned perovskite stability range, therefore increasing the chances for successful synthesis.

In this work, we use first-principles density-functional theory (DFT) to study the properties of ground state structures of the SAN solid solution. We elucidate the nature of the local environment, relating cation displacements and octahedral tilting to polarization.

II. METHODOLOGY

In the present study, cell parameters (lattice constants and angles) are optimized using the ABINIT software package.\textsuperscript{18} An in-house solid state DFT code, BH, employed in previous studies\textsuperscript{19,20} is used to relax the ionic positions of all atoms. We use the local density approximation (LDA) of the exchange correlation functional and a 4 × 4 × 4 Monkhorst-Pack sampling of the Brillouin zone\textsuperscript{21} for all calculations, except for the Berry phase polarization calculations for which a 6 × 6 × 6 grid was used.\textsuperscript{22} To calculate the phonon frequencies of each supercell at \(\Gamma\), as well as the piezoelectric coefficients \(\epsilon_{ij}\), we used density functional perturbation theory\textsuperscript{23} and strain linear response calculations,\textsuperscript{24} respectively. We found no imaginary phonon frequencies at \(\Gamma\) and conclude that all supercells are dynamically stable. All calculations are performed with a plane wave cutoff of 50 Ry and all atoms are represented by norm-conserving optimized\textsuperscript{25} nonlocal\textsuperscript{26} pseudopotentials, generated by the OPUS code.\textsuperscript{27} Each of the B-site arrangements of Sn(Al\textsubscript{1/2}Nb\textsubscript{1/2})O\textsubscript{3} (SAN)
TABLE I. Presented first are the supercell lattice constants in Å for Sn(Al$_{1/2}$Nb$_{1/2}$)O$_3$ solid solution. Shown next are the angles between axes, the polarization in units of C/m$^2$ for all three directions, the total polarization and finally the difference in total energy relative to Super cell 1, in units of eV per 40-atom supercell.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supercell</th>
<th>$a$</th>
<th>$b$</th>
<th>$c$</th>
<th>$\alpha$</th>
<th>$\beta$</th>
<th>$\gamma$</th>
<th>$P_x$</th>
<th>$P_y$</th>
<th>$P_z$</th>
<th>$P_{tot}$</th>
<th>$E_{diff}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>7.789</td>
<td>7.887</td>
<td>7.887</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>7.938</td>
<td>7.933</td>
<td>7.777</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.039</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.806</td>
<td>8.033</td>
<td>7.825</td>
<td>89.3</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.699</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>7.831</td>
<td>7.942</td>
<td>7.858</td>
<td>89.5</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.46</td>
<td>0.41</td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td>0.408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>7.887</td>
<td>7.874</td>
<td>7.868</td>
<td>90.1</td>
<td>90.2</td>
<td>89.7</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.406</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>7.917</td>
<td>7.784</td>
<td>7.918</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>90.5</td>
<td>90.0</td>
<td>0.53</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.067</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

is studied in a $2 \times 2 \times 2$ 40-atom supercell to reproduce any of the common three-dimensional tilt systems$^{28-30}$ that could be found experimentally.

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

We find that for all SAN supercells studied, the ground state structure (see Table I and Fig. 1) is ferroelectric with polarization values varying from 0.58 to 0.77 C/m$^2$. The orientation of the polarization vector varies according to B-site cation arrangement. With regards to the lattice constants, SAN supercells resemble either tetragonal (supercells 1, 2, and 6) or orthorhombic (supercells 3, 4, and 5) structures. For the majority of supercells, the difference between the $c$ and $a$ lattice constants is small, in contrast to the large $c/a$ values found for SnTiO$_3$. In supercells 1, 2, and 6, the ratio between the polar and the nonpolar axes ranges from 1.01 to 1.03. Similar ratios between the axes are found for supercells 3, 4, and 5. However, each contains at least one angle $\neq 90^\circ$, decreasing macroscopic supercell symmetry to either monoclinic (supercells 1–4, and 6) or triclinic (supercell 5), regardless of cation arrangement. Asymmetric cation displacements decrease the symmetry of all supercells to $P1$ symmetry.

We use the same ten supercells as in the work of Qi et al.$^{31}$ since the tetragonal symmetry associated with most common ferroelectrics would yield these ten unique structures. We find, however, that only supercells 1 through 6 are unique, while 7 through 10 relax to 2, 3, 4, and 5 respectively. These six supercells can be viewed as sampling the local B-cation arrangement resulting from quenched disorder on the $B$-site.$^{17,32}$ This disorder arises when the solid solution is rapidly cooled during typical solid state synthesis. At high temperature, the $B$-cations are disordered and migrate freely between the sites. Rapid cooling freezes in the high temperature $B$-site cation disorder.

A comparison of total energies shows that energy differences between the different $B$-cation arrangements in SAN are similar to the standard electrostatically driven $B$-cation energetics found in Ba- and Pb-based perovskites. The standard model predicts the rocksalt Al/Nb ordering to be the lowest energy. This is the case for Ba(Sc$_{1/2}$Nb$_{1/2}$)O$_3$ (BSN) and Pb(Sc$_{1/2}$Nb$_{1/2}$)O$_3$ (PSN) and we find this to be true for SAN also. The range of total energy differences ($\approx$0.7 eV/40-atom cell) is similar to that found by DFT calculations for PSN, in between those for the Ba-based$^{15}$ and Bi-based materials.$^{31}$ However, according to the standard model, the planar stacking of the $B$-cations will be the highest energy $B$-cation arrangement, as is found for BSN and PSN materials. In SAN solid solution though, we find that the planar stacking of Al and Nb is only slightly higher in energy (supercell 2) than the rocksalt Al/Nb arrangement and is much lower in energy than a variety of other $B$-cation arrangements including the (011) ordering. These (011) $B$-cation arrangements are unfavorable and will most likely only rarely be present in SAN.

For all supercells, the minimum energy volume is $\approx$60 Å$^3$, corresponding to $a = 3.90 \text{ Å}$. This is essentially identical to the LDA minimum energy volume found previously for SnTiO$_3$, as expected since the average ionic radius of Al and Nb ions is slightly smaller than that of Ti. For supercell 3, lattice constant $a$ is smaller but the large value of lattice constant $c$ makes the overall volume equal to that of PbTiO$_3$ material.

In this case, there is a (011) type $B$-cation ordering with unfavorable Nb$^{5+}$-Nb$^{5+}$ interactions. Even though the supercell elongates in the direction of the most Nb-Nb pairs in response to the cation repulsion, this cation ordering is still unfavorable. In supercells 4, 5, and 6, Nb$^{5+}$-Nb$^{5+}$ pairs are along a Cartesian axis in which Al$^{3+}$-Nb$^{5+}$ pairs, as well as Al$^{3+}$-Al$^{3+}$ pairs are present. This serves to decrease the unfavorable ionic interactions observed in supercell 3 and $c/a$ is therefore close to 1. Due to their lower energies, these supercells are more representative of the SAN solid solution.

The triclinic structure of supercell 5 found by our calculations for SAN is reminiscent of the low-symmetry structures observed in PMN-PT, PZT, and other solid solutions at the morphotropic phase boundary (MPB) compositions.$^{32,36}$ In those cases, the potential energy surface for the $P$ vector rotation is flat, leading to a high electromechanical response.

FIG. 1. $B$-site cation arrangements of Sn(Al$_{1/2}$Nb$_{1/2}$)O$_3$ supercells 1 through 10. Al is white and Nb is light gray.
We therefore assign a displacement of Al is slightly smaller than that for Nb (0.17˚A). Nb displacements in SAN suggests that the reference ionic Sn-based ferroelectrics as well. The comparison of Al and solid solutions with high PT content. The similarity between cation ionic displacements obtained by DFT calculations of ionic displacements were evaluated previously from the additive is needed to cross the phase boundary. The reference solid solution is to an MPB, and therefore how much tetragonal or orthorhombic system. For all supercells, the diagonal piezoelectric coefficients are larger than e_{33} = 2.7 C/m^2 found for SnTiO_3 by Uratani et al.\(^8\) With the exception of supercells 1 and 4 the diagonal e_{ij} coefficients are also larger than the PbTiO_3 e_{33} coefficient. In particular for supercell 5, we find e_{33} = 11.8 C/m^2, quite close to the e_{33} = 12.6 C/m^2 previously found for 50/50 PZT.\(^3\) This high e_{ij} is related to the fact that supercell 5 exhibits a monoclinic (211) orientation of the polarization vector, as 50/50 PZT does. Examination of the off-diagonal elements of the e tensor shows that for most supercells they are comparable to the e_{31} and e_{15} coefficients of PbTiO_3 and SnTiO_3. However, high values of the e_{15} (10.5 C/m^2) and e_{31} (7.3 C/m^2) coefficients are found in supercells 1 and 5, respectively. These large piezoelectric coefficients support the hypothesis that SAN is close to the MPB.

Our previously developed theory for predicting the location of the MPB in a solid solution\(^3\) can be used to estimate the compositional proximity of SAN to an MPB. In Pb-based solid solutions with PbTiO_3 (PT), the PT content at the MPB \((x_{PT}^{MPB})\) is given by

\[
x_{PT}^{MPB} = 1 - 1/(0.34 + 3.31R_{B,avg} - 7.49D_{B,avg}^0),
\]

where \(R_{B,avg}\) is the average Shannon ionic radius for the \(B\)-site and \(D_{B,avg}^0\) is the average reference ionic displacement of the \(B\)-site.

Equation (2) shows how both the displacement and size of the \(B\)-cations can be used as a guide to estimate how close a solid solution is to an MPB, and therefore how much tetragonal additive is needed to cross the phase boundary. The reference ionic displacements were evaluated previously from the \(B\)-cation ionic displacements obtained by DFT calculations of solid solutions with high PT content. The similarity between Pb and Sn behavior suggests that Eq. (2) will be valid for Sn-based ferroelectrics as well. The comparison of Al and Nb displacements in SAN suggests that the reference ionic displacement of Al is slightly smaller than that for Nb (0.17 Å). We therefore assign a \(D_{B}^0 = 0.11 \) Å to Al. Substituting the ionic radii for Al (0.53 Å) and Nb (0.64 Å) and \(D_{B}^0\) values into Eq. (2) we obtain \(x_{PT}^{MPB} = 0.18\). Thus, only a small amount of tetragonal dopant into SAN will be necessary to result in a preference for tetragonal phase. Since SnTiO_3 exhibits a higher \(c/a\) ratio than PT, it is likely that less than 18% doping of SnTiO_3 will be necessary to create an MPB in an SAN-SnTiO_3 solid solution.

To further support the hypothesis that SAN is close to an MPB, we directly calculate the energy cost of \(\vec{P}\) rotation, using rocksalt ordered supercell 1 as our example. Though the ground state of this configuration is monoclinic, \(\vec{P}\) along (011), we also obtain a stable local energy minimum tetragonal \((x = \beta = \gamma = 90^\circ)\) structure with \(a = 7.768\) and \(c = 7.905 \) Å, \(c/a = 1.02,\) and \(\vec{P}\) along (001). The difference in total energy between the monoclinic ground state and the tetragonal structure, with the same \(B\)-cation ordering, is small, 0.213 eV/40-atom cell.

The examination of all supercells show that the ionic displacements from high-symmetry positions are similar to those found previously for Pb-based perovskites. The polarization is caused by the concerted movement of Sn, Al, and Nb cations from the center of their oxygen cages. As expected, the displacements of Sn atoms are much larger than those for the \(B\)-cations. Similar to the heterovalent Pb-based perovskites,\(^7\) Sn displaces toward the underbonded O atoms with two Al

![FIG. 2. (Color online) Sn-Al and Sn-Nb partial PDFs shown as solid black and dashed red lines respectively. On average, Sn-Nb distances are larger than Sn-Al distances, demonstrating that Sn displacements are directed away from Nb and toward Al.](image1)

![FIG. 3. (Color online) Comparison of Sn-O, Pb-O, and Bi-O partial PDFs. Sn-O shown in solid black line is obtained from current work. Pb-O and Bi-O data from previous work.\(^6,32\) are shown as dashed short (red) and dashed long (green) lines, respectively.](image2)
neighbors, and away from the overbonded O atoms with two Nb neighbors. This can be seen from a comparison of the Sn-Al and Sn-Nb partial pair distribution functions (PDFs) in Fig. 2 (obtained from structure 3), where the Sn-Al peaks are located at significantly smaller distances than the Sn-Nb peak.

A comparison of the Sn-O partial PDFs with Pb-O and Bi-O partial PDFs from previous work allows us to assign an ionic size for a 12-fold coordinated Sn\(^{2+}\) (Fig. 3). While all three PDFs exhibit three sets of peaks due to the creation of strong, medium, and weak \(A\)-\(O\) bonds by the \(A\)-cation displacements, the peaks for the strong Sn-O bonds are located at smaller distances (2.3 Å) than the strong Pb-O bonds (2.5 Å). The weak Sn-O bonds are also shorter than the weak Pb-O bonds, as shown in Fig. 3. This indicates that the ionic size of 12-fold coordinated Sn is smaller than that of Pb (\(r_{\text{Pb}} = 1.49\) Å), allowing the Sn to come closer to the O atoms. The ionic size of Sn is larger than that of Bi (\(r_{\text{Bi}} = 1.36\) Å), as can be seen by a comparison of shortest Sn-O distances (2.3 Å) to the distances for the strongest Bi-O bonds (2.1 Å). We therefore estimate the ionic size of Sn\(^{2+}\) to be around 1.4 Å in the 12-fold coordination of the perovskite \(A\) site. This yields \(t = 1.00\) for SAN solid solution and \(t = 0.99\) for SnTiO\(_3\).

An examination of the octahedral tilt magnitudes in SAN provides further support for our assignment of \(r_{\text{Sn}^{2+}} = 1.4\) Å. We find (Fig. 4) that octahedral tilts of the \(O_6\) cages are rather small, ranging from 0° to 4°. This is similar to the octahedral tilts found in the 50/50 MPB composition of PZT, where \(t = 0.99\) (Ref. 32). The small tilts of \(O_6\) cages found for SAN similarly indicate that the preferred \(A\)-\(O\) and \(B\)-\(O\) distances in SAN are closely matched, with \(t\) close to 1.

Despite a slightly higher value of the tolerance factor, which usually favors tetragonality, the \(c/a\) ratios for SAN supercells are much smaller than the \(c/a = 1.10\) value found for SnTiO\(_3\). This is due to the differences in the \(B\)-site chemistry between the two materials. The average displacements of both the Nb (0.17 Å) and Al ions (0.11 Å) are smaller than the Ti off-centering in either PbTiO\(_3\) (0.28 Å) or SnTiO\(_3\) (0.33 Å). The small \(B\)-site off-centering diminishes the strain-polarization coupling and makes large tetragonality unfavorable. The small Nb displacements are most likely due to the larger ionic size of the Nb ion. For Al, the lack of \(d\)-states makes the Al-O bonding ionic which favors small displacements.

Turning our attention toward the electronic structure of SAN, examination of the DFT-LDA band structures shows that the indirect SAN band gap ranges from 1.7 to 2.2 eV, slightly higher than the DFT-LDA calculated gap for PbTiO\(_3\) (1.5 eV). As an example, the electronic band structure of supercell 1 is shown in Fig. 5. These DFT-LDA band gaps are underestimated, in line with previously reported trends. There are slight differences between the nature of the valence and conduction bands of SAN and PbTiO\(_3\). In ferroelectric PbTiO\(_3\), the valence band is composed mainly of hybridized O\(^2\)\(p\) and Pb 6\(s\) orbitals, and the conduction band is composed mainly of Ti 3\(d\) (Ref. 42). Figure 6 shows that in SAN, the valence bands are mainly Sn 5\(s\) and O 2\(p\) orbitals, similar to PbTiO\(_3\).
Sn(Al_{1/2}Nb_{1/2})O_3 (SAN). This material has \( t = 1.00 \), within the range of experimentally feasible perovskite solid oxides, though the synthesis of SAN could potentially be hindered by the chemical reactivity of Sn. We show that the properties of the ground state supercells resemble those previously found in ferroelectrics in close proximity to a morphotropic phase boundary, such as PZT. We believe that a slight amount of tetragonal additive can stabilize a tetragonal phase, creating an MPB and will also lead to an increase in polarization. To further support the proximity of SAN to an MPB, we find that for the rocksalt ordered supercell 1, the barrier to rotation of polarization from (011) to (001) is low. We also predict that the electronic structure of SAN is similar to that of PbTiO_3. The possibility of creating an MPB in a solid solution of SAN and SnTiO_3 is thus favorable for the development of Sn-based piezoelectrics to replace the Pb-based perovskites used in current technologies.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

JWB and AMR were supported by the US DOE Office of Basic Science, under Grant No. DE-FG02-07ER46431. IG was supported by the US Office of Naval Research, under Grant No. N00014-09-1-0157. PKD acknowledges support from the US Office of Naval Research through Contract No. N00014-09-1-0455. Computational support was provided by US DOD by a DURIP grant and by the HPCMO. Supported by the Energy Commercialization Institute, a program of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania’s Ben Franklin Technology Development Authority through the Ben Franklin Technology Partners of Southeastern Pennsylvania. The authors would like to acknowledge K. M. Rabe and D. R. Hamann for helpful discussions pertaining to the calculation of piezoelectric tensors.

IV. CONCLUSION

We have presented calculations of the ground state structure and polarization of the Pb-free ferroelectric solid solution PbTiO_3; however, there is also a significant amount of both the Nb 5s and Al 3s characters also present. The conduction band is mainly of Nb 4d character, similar to the Ti 3d of PbTiO_3, yet there is a slight amount of Sn 5p mixed into the band that overlaps with empty Al 3p states. This mixing of states could potentially be of interest as a way to decrease the band gap further by substituting more covalently bonded A- and B-site cations into SAN.

FIG. 6. (Color online) Projected density of states of SAN supercell 1. The DFT-LDA calculated band gap is 1.77 eV. The valence character dominant in the conduction band.

13V. M. Goldschmidt, Naturwissenschaften 21, 477 (1926).