Caltech

Workshop on Qubits and Spacetime

Institute of Advanced Studies December 3 - 4th, 2019

Entanglement Wedge Reconstruction in Infinite-dimensional Hilbert Spaces

MONICA JINWOO KANG

CALIFORNIA INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

arXiv: 1811.05482, 1910.06328 (MJK, Kolchmeyer), To appear (MJK, Tang), To appear(MJK, Gesteau)

Three ingredients



Holography





Von Neumann algebra



Local operator algebra

Von Neumann algebra

Finite-dimensional Hilbert space: I_n

Infinite-dimensional Hilbert space: $I_{\infty}, II_1, II_{\infty}, III_{\lambda} (0 \le \lambda \le 1)$

Local operator algebra = vN algebra

> QFTs with (infinite-dimensional) Hilbert space

> Local operator algebras

= (infinite-dimensional) von Neumann algebra $M \subset B(\mathcal{H})$

the set of bounded operators in $\,\mathscr{H}\,$

► Commutant: $M' = \{ \mathcal{O} \in B(\mathcal{H}) \mid \mathcal{OP} = \mathcal{PO} \forall \mathcal{P} \in M \}$

> Von Neumann algebra:

an algebra of bounded operators that

1) contains the identity, 2) closed under Hermitian conjugation, 3)M = M''(*-algebra)

Quantum Error Correction

Local bulk operators

of the physical Hilbert space of the CFT

Finite-dimensional Hilbert space:



Quantum Error Correction

Holography

vN algebra

Finite-dimensional Hilbert space



Reeh-Schlieder theorem

> Want theories compatible with Reeh-Schlieder theorem.

• Then this leads to infinite-dimensional Hilbert spaces!

Reeh-Schlieder theorem:

For any region A, by acting on the vacuum $|\Omega\rangle$ with operators located in that region we can produce a set of states which is dense in the full Hilbert space of the QFT.

> Start with a cyclic and separating state, by acting with a suitable local operator



Obtain a dense subset of the Hilbert space $\,\mathscr{H}\,$

Cyclic and Separating state

- \succ Define a map $e_{\Psi}: M \longrightarrow \mathscr{H}$ where $\mathscr{O} \mapsto \mathscr{O} | \Psi > \mathscr{V}$
- > $|\Psi>$ is cyclic with respect to a von Neumann algebra M $\iff \mathcal{H}$ is the closure of the image of e_{Ψ}
- > $|\Psi>$ is separating with respect to a von Neumann algebra M \iff ker $e_{\Psi} = 0$ (injection)

If the physical content of the Reeh-Schlieder theorem is relevant for the bulk, the bulk reconstruction needs to be understood in infinite-dimensional Hilbert spaces.

- > Assume there is a unique ground state $|\Omega \rangle \in \mathcal{H}$
- > The closure of the set of states obtained by acting on $|\Omega>$ (with sums of products of smeared operator)



Each superselection sector of the theory is invariant subspace of the algebra of local operators

Open region of spacetime

$$\mathcal{U} \xrightarrow{\mathsf{Define}} A(\mathcal{U})$$

An associated local operator algebra

			Unbounded!	
Open region of spacetime	U	Define	A(u)	An associated local operator algebra







Von Neumann algebra $M(u) \subset B(\mathcal{H})$







Bulk theory may be effectively described by a QFT on a global AdS background

Use von Neumann algebras to describe operators associated with covariantly defined subregions in the bulk



Bulk theory may be effectively described by a QFT on a global AdS background

> Use von Neumann algebras to describe

operators associated with covariantly defined subregions in the bulk

i.e. Entanglement wedge of a boundary subregion



Bulk theory may be effectively described by a QFT on a global AdS background

> Use von Neumann algebras to describe

operators associated with covariantly defined subregions in the bulk

i.e. Entanglement wedge of a boundary subregion Causally complete!



Bulk theory may be effectively described by a QFT on a global AdS background

> Use von Neumann algebras to describe

operators associated with covariantly defined subregions in the bulk

i.e. Entanglement wedge of a boundary subregion

Causally complete! Naturally have an associated von Neumann algebra

Recall: Finite-dimensional Hilbert space



(minimal surface)

















Relative Entropy

- > In finite-dimensional Hilbert spaces: $S(\rho, \sigma) = \text{Tr} \left(\rho \log \rho \rho \log \sigma\right)$
- > The relative entropy $S(\rho, \sigma)$ does not increase upon performing a partial trace on ρ and σ .
 - The relative entropy may be intuitively thought of as a measure of distinguishability between two states.
- Infinite-dimensional case needs Tomita-Takesaki theory using von Neumann algebra.

Relative Entropy using von Neumann algebra

 $\succ |\Psi > , |\Phi > \in \mathcal{H}, |\Psi >$ is cyclic and separating.

 \succ Relative modular operator $\Delta_{\Psi|\Phi} := S_{\Psi|\Phi}^{\dagger} S_{\Psi|\Phi}$

where $S_{\Psi|\Phi}$ is a relative Tomita operator that acts as $S_{\Psi|\Phi}|x \ge |y > \forall \{\mathcal{O}_n\} \in M$ such that the limits $|x \ge \lim_{n \to \infty} \mathcal{O}_n|\Psi > \text{and } |y \ge \lim_{n \to \infty} \mathcal{O}_n^{\dagger}|\Phi > \text{exist.}$

 \succ *Relative entropy* with respect to *M* of $|\Psi >$

$$S_{\Psi|\Phi}(M) = - \langle \Psi| \log \Delta_{\Psi|\Phi} | \Psi \rangle$$

The equivalence theorem

1811.05482 (MJK, Kolchmeyer)

> For (infinite-dimensional) Hilbert spaces:

Entanglement Wedge Reconstruction



Relative Entropy Equivalence Between the bulk and the boundary

- Ingredients of the theorem:
 - An isometry $u: \mathscr{H}_{code} \to \mathscr{H}_{phys}$
 - Von Neumann algebras on \mathscr{H}_{code} and \mathscr{H}_{phys} : $M_{code}, M'_{code}, M_{phys}, M'_{phys}$
- > Assumption required:
 - If $|\Psi \rangle \in \mathscr{H}_{code}$ is cyclic and separating with respect to M_{code} , then $u |\Psi \rangle$ is cyclic and separating with respect to M_{phys} .

The equivalence theorem

1811.05482 (MJK, Kolchmeyer)

Entanglement Wedge Reconstruction

$$\begin{split} \forall \mathcal{O} \in M_{code} \; \forall \mathcal{O}' \in M'_{code}, \quad \exists \tilde{\mathcal{O}} \in M_{phys} \; \exists \tilde{\mathcal{O}}' \in M'_{phys} \; \text{ such that} \\ \forall | \Theta > \in \mathscr{H}_{code} \; \left\{ \begin{aligned} u \mathcal{O} | \Theta > &= \tilde{\mathcal{O}} u | \Theta > , & u \mathcal{O}' | \Theta > &= \tilde{\mathcal{O}}' u | \Theta > , \\ u \mathcal{O}^{\dagger} | \Theta > &= \tilde{\mathcal{O}}^{\dagger} u | \Theta > , & u \mathcal{O}'^{\dagger} | \Theta > &= \tilde{\mathcal{O}}'^{\dagger} u | \Theta > . \end{aligned} \right. \end{split}$$

Relative Entropy Equivalence Between the bulk and the boundary $\forall |\Psi > , |\Phi > \in \mathscr{H}_{code} \text{ with } |\Psi > \text{ cyclic and separating w.r.t. } M_{code}$ $S_{\Psi|\Phi}(M_{code}) = S_{u\Psi|u\Phi}(M_{phys}), \text{ and } S_{\Psi|\Phi}(M'_{code}) = S_{u\Psi|u\Phi}(M'_{phys})$

A toy model: tensor network

➤ Goal: build an explicit quantum error correcting code that is of infinite-dimensional von Neumann algebra of type II₁.

> Want a uniform tensor network — consider *qutrits*!

> Finite-dimensional collection:



A finite-dimensional tensor network

Three-qutrit code

1910.06328 (MJK, Kolchmeyer)

$$\begin{cases} |0\rangle \longrightarrow \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \left(|\tilde{0}\tilde{0}\tilde{0}\rangle + |\tilde{1}\tilde{1}\tilde{1}\rangle + |\tilde{2}\tilde{2}\tilde{2}\rangle \right), \\ |1\rangle \longrightarrow \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \left(|\tilde{0}\tilde{1}\tilde{2}\rangle + |\tilde{1}\tilde{2}\tilde{0}\rangle + |\tilde{2}\tilde{0}\tilde{1}\rangle \right), \\ |2\rangle \longrightarrow \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \left(|\tilde{0}\tilde{2}\tilde{1}\rangle + |\tilde{1}\tilde{0}\tilde{2}\rangle + |\tilde{2}\tilde{1}\tilde{0}\rangle \right). \end{cases}$$
$$\implies \qquad |i\rangle \longrightarrow \sum_{\tilde{a},\tilde{b},\tilde{c}} T_{i\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{c}} |\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{c}\rangle, \end{cases}$$



[~] denotes qutrits in the physical Hilbert space

 \succ The isometry

$$|p>_{i}|q>_{j}\longrightarrow\sum_{\tilde{x},\tilde{y},\tilde{z},\tilde{c},\tilde{w}}\sqrt{3}T_{p\tilde{x}\tilde{y}\tilde{c}}T_{q\tilde{z}\tilde{w}\tilde{c}}|\tilde{x}>_{\tilde{a}}|\tilde{y}>_{\tilde{b}}|\tilde{z}>_{\tilde{d}}|\tilde{w}>_{\tilde{e}}$$

 \tilde{c} $\tilde{}$ denotes gutrits in the physical Hilbert space

> Three-qutrit code

$$\implies |i\rangle \longrightarrow \sum_{\tilde{a},\tilde{b},\tilde{c}} T_{i\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{c}} |\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{c}\rangle,$$

> The isometry

 \succ The reference state

$$|\lambda\rangle := \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \left[|00\rangle + |11\rangle + |22\rangle \right]$$

Maximally entangled state

$$|p>_{i}|q>_{j} \longrightarrow \sum_{\tilde{x},\tilde{y},\tilde{z},\tilde{c},\tilde{w}} \sqrt{3}T_{p\tilde{x}\tilde{y}\tilde{c}}T_{q\tilde{z}\tilde{w}\tilde{c}} |\tilde{x}>_{\tilde{a}} |\tilde{y}>_{\tilde{b}} |\tilde{z}>_{\tilde{d}} |\tilde{w}>_{\tilde{e}}$$

- $> |\psi >_{ij}$ a vector in the Hilbert space of the black qutrits i, j
- $\gg |\tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}$ its image under the isometry
- $\succ U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}} \text{ and } U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} \text{ the unitary operator acting on qutrits } \tilde{a}, \tilde{b} \text{ and } \tilde{d}, \tilde{e}$ $\succ \text{ Then: } U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}^{\dagger}U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}^{\dagger} | \tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} = | \psi >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{d}} | \lambda >_{\tilde{b}\tilde{e}}$



- $> |\psi >_{ij}$ a vector in the Hilbert space of the black qutrits i, j
- $\gg |\tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}$ its image under the isometry
- > $U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}$ and $U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}$ the unitary operator acting on qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{b} and \tilde{d}, \tilde{e} > Then: $U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}^{\dagger}U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}^{\dagger} | \tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} = | \psi >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{d}} | \lambda >_{\tilde{b}\tilde{e}}$

The same state as $|\psi\rangle_{ij}$ except on white qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{d}



- $> |\psi >_{ij}$ a vector in the Hilbert space of the black qutrits i, j
- $\gg |\tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}$ its image under the isometry
- > $U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}$ and $U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}$ the unitary operator acting on qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{b} and \tilde{d}, \tilde{e} > Then: $U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}^{\dagger}U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}^{\dagger} | \tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} = | \psi >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{d}} | \lambda >_{\tilde{b}\tilde{e}}$ The same state as $|\psi >_{ij}$ except on white qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{d} Recover Recover $\tilde{a} \bigcirc \tilde{c} \bigcirc \tilde{d}$

- $\gg |\psi\rangle_{ii}$ a vector in the Hilbert space of the black qutrits i, j $\gg |\tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}|$ its image under the isometry $> U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}$ and $U_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}}$ the unitary operator acting on qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{b} and d, \tilde{e} $U^{\dagger}_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}U^{\dagger}_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} | \tilde{\psi} >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} = | \psi >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{d}} | \lambda >_{\tilde{b}\tilde{e}}$ **>** Then: The same state as $|\psi\rangle_{ii}$ except on white qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{d} Recover \tilde{c} Recover $\succ 0$ an operator that acts on the qutrit i
- $\succ \tilde{O}$ an operator that acts on the adjacent white qutrits \tilde{a}, \tilde{b}

$$\tilde{\mathcal{O}} := \sum_{p,q} _i \left[U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}} \,|\, p >_{\tilde{a}} < q \,|_{\tilde{a}} U_{\tilde{a}\tilde{b}}^{\dagger} \otimes I_{\tilde{d}\tilde{e}} \right]$$

An infinite-dimensional tensor network

> Now juxtapose infinitely...

1910.06328 (MJK, Kolchmeyer)



> Pre-Hilbert space $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ is defined to include *states of black qutrits* where all but finitely many pairs of black qutrits are in the state $|\lambda > .$

> Any vector in $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ = a finite linear combination of vectors in an over complete basis

Each basis vector:

$$|M, p_1, \cdots, p_M, q_1, \cdots, q_M > := \left[|p_1 >_{i_1} |q_1 >_{j_1} \right] \otimes \cdots \left[|p_1 >_{i_M} |q_1 >_{j_M} \right] \otimes |\lambda > 1$$

> Pre-Hilbert space $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ is defined to include states of black qutrits where all but finitely many pairs of black qutrits are in the state $|\lambda > .$

> Any vector in $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ = a finite linear combination of vectors in an over complete basis

Not linearly independent!

> Pre-Hilbert space $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ is defined to include states of black qutrits where all but finitely many pairs of black qutrits are in the state $|\lambda > .$

> Any vector in $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ = a finite linear combination of vectors in an over complete basis

> Consider two basis vectors $|M, \{p,q\}_1 > \text{and } |M, \{p,q\}_2 >$

Inner product: ignore collections beyond $\max(M_1, M_2)$ Take the usual inner product on the remaining $9^{\max(M_1, M_2)}$ -dimensional Hilbert space

> Pre-Hilbert space $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ is defined to include states of black qutrits where all but finitely many pairs of black qutrits are in the state $|\lambda > .$

> Any vector in $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ = a finite linear combination of vectors in an over complete basis

> Consider two basis vectors $|M, \{p,q\}_1 > \text{and } |M, \{p,q\}_2 >$

 $\begin{array}{ll} \text{Inner product: ignore collections beyond } \max{(M_1,M_2)} & \text{Not mutually orthogonal but all normalized} \\ \text{Take the usual inner product on the remaining } 9^{\max{(M_1,M_2)}} \text{-dimensional Hilbert space} \end{array}$

> Pre-Hilbert space $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ is defined to include states of black qutrits where all but finitely many pairs of black qutrits are in the state $|\lambda > .$

> Any vector in $p\mathcal{H}_{code}$ = a finite linear combination of vectors in an over complete basis

> Consider two basis vectors $|M, \{p,q\}_1 > \text{and } |M, \{p,q\}_2 >$ Not mutually orthogonal

With inner product: we can define Cauchy sequences $\mathcal{H}_{code} = \text{the closure of } p\mathcal{H}_{code} \text{ so that all Cauchy sequence in } \mathcal{H}_{code} \text{ converges}$

The operator algebra: closed under the strong limit

> Analogously for operators

We can define *-algebra of operators acting on finite number of qutrits

To get the von Neumann algebra M, we need to compute the $M^{\prime\prime}$

> Unlike C*-algebra, von Neumann algebra is closed under the strong limit (i.e. $\lim_{n \to \infty} \mathcal{O}_n |\Psi\rangle = \mathcal{O} |\Psi\rangle \quad \forall \psi \in \mathcal{H}$)

Physical pre-Hilbert and Hilbert spaces

- > Can be done similarly to construct $p\mathcal{H}_{phys}$ and \mathcal{H}_{phys}
- > For each collection, 4 white qutrits
- > Physical reference state $|\lambda\lambda\rangle := |\lambda\rangle_{\tilde{a}\tilde{d}} |\lambda\rangle_{\tilde{b}\tilde{e}}$ Image of $|\lambda\rangle_{ij}$
- > Construct the von Neumann algebras for the boundary

Physical pre-Hilbert and Hilbert spaces

- \succ Can be done similarly to construct $p\mathcal{H}_{phys}$ and \mathcal{H}_{phys}
- > For each collection, 4 white qutrits
- $\succ Physical reference state |\lambda\lambda > := |\lambda >_{\tilde{a}\tilde{d}} |\lambda >_{\tilde{b}\tilde{e}} \quad Image of |\lambda >_{ij}$
- > Construct the von Neumann algebras for the boundary

Using in this manner, we can explicitly write down operators, von Neumann algebras as their operator algebras, unitaries, the isometry map



Showed that Entanglement Wedge reconstruction is satisfied for this toy model

Generalize: von Neumann algebras of various type

Previously: every collection has a reference state $|\lambda\rangle := \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \left[|00\rangle + |11\rangle + |22\rangle \right]$ An infinite sequence of (separable) Hilbert spaces \mathscr{H}_n , each equipped with a reference state $|\lambda_n\rangle := \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 + \alpha^2 + \beta^2}} \left[|00\rangle + \alpha |11\rangle + \beta |22\rangle \right]$ To appear (MJK, Tang) $\alpha = \beta = 0$: type I_∞ $\alpha = \beta = 1$: type I_1 (the previous case, maximally entangled state)

 $\succ \alpha = 1$ and $\beta = 0$: type II_{∞}

 $> \alpha, \beta \neq 0$ and $\log \alpha / \log \beta \notin \mathbb{Q}$: type III_1 (the generic operator algebra of local QFTs)

$$\succ \alpha = \gamma^k, \ \beta = \gamma^\ell \ for \ k, \ell \in \mathbb{Z}_+ \ and \ 0 < \gamma < 1 : type III_{\lambda} \ for \ \lambda = \gamma^{gcd(k,\ell)}$$

 $\succ (\alpha < 1 \text{ and } \beta = 0) \text{ or } (\alpha = 0 \text{ and } \beta < 1) : type III_{\alpha} \text{ or } III_{\beta}$

 $\succ \alpha > 1$ and $\beta = 0$ or $\alpha = 0$ and $\beta > 1$: type $III_{\alpha^{-1}}$ or $III_{\beta^{-1}}$

Tensor product of types of vN algebras



> More generally putting: type $T \rightarrow$ type $T \times H_1 =$ type?

Tensor product of types of vN algebras

To appear (MJK, Tang) Generalize for $M_A \otimes M_B$ $a_{\scriptscriptstyle N}$ M_{phys} $A \backslash B$ $I_n \qquad I_\infty \qquad II_1$ II_{∞} III_{λ} III_1 $\overline{I_m}$ I_{nm} I_{∞} II_1 II_{∞} $\blacksquare M_{code}$ III_{λ} III_1 ... $I_{\infty} \mid I_{\infty} \quad I_{\infty} \quad II_{\infty} \quad II_{\infty}$ III_{λ} III_1 $= M'_{code}$ $II_1 \mid II_1$ II_{∞} II_{1} II_{∞} III_{λ} III_1 II_{∞} $|II_{\infty}|$ $II_{\infty} \quad II_{\infty}$ II_{∞} III_{λ} III_1 III_{μ} III_{μ} III_{μ} III_{μ} III_{μ} III_{σ} III_1 **Collection N** III_1 III_1 III_1 III_1 III_1 III_1 III_1 type $T \rightarrow$ type $T \times II_1 =$ type? $0 < \mu, \lambda < 1, \quad \sigma = \begin{cases} \alpha^{\gcd(k,\ell)} & \text{if } \log \lambda / \log \mu \in \mathbb{Q} \end{cases}$ otherwise

More complex QECC

For more complicated quantum error correcting codes (cf. HaPPY code)
No way to construct the Hilbert space directly due to high complexity.

>	The toy model considered	State-pushing
	More complex QECC	Operator-pushing

Now easier to work with C*-algebra instead of von Neumann algebra as the first step and connect to von Neumann algebra afterwards for (thermal) states and relative entropies.

Von Neumann algebra is state-dependent but C*-algebra is not (with no 'commutant' either)

To appear (MJK, Gesteau)



The thermal state: cyclic & separating on C*-algebra and von Neumann algebra
We can extend to more nontrivial QECCs and have entanglement wedge reconstructions (cf. HaPPY code)

Thank you for listening!